

Borough of Carlisle
53 W. South Street
Carlisle, PA 17013
P: 717-249-4422
F: 717-240-6615



**BOROUGH OF CARLISLE
COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
March 12, 2020**

Mayor Scott called the Council Meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. and Councilor Stuby led the Moment of Silence and Pledge of Allegiance.

Council members present: Councilors Crampsie, Fulham-Winston, Hicks, Landis, Stuby, Deputy Mayor Shultz and Mayor Scott. Also present were: Borough Manager Armstrong, Assistant Borough Manager Snyder, Police Chief Landis, Water Resources Director Malarich, Community Development Manager Skelly, Parks & Recreation Director Crouse, Finance Director Juday, Fire Chief Snyder, Public Information Coordinator Taylor, Solicitor Brenneman, Dickinson Law School Student Ambassador Speer and Borough Secretary Stone.

PRESENTATION

Carlisle Resilience Collaborative:

Mr. Jim Burgess, 116 Greenbrier Lane, Dillsburg, Pennsylvania, representing the Carlisle Resilience Collaborative, spoke of a film that will show at the Carlisle Theater to educate the public on the effects of adverse childhood trauma and events. This effort is to promote support to help children in the community overcome childhood trauma events. Mr. Burgess introduced an individual named Tonia, who experienced an abundance of childhood traumas. Tonia shared a poem that described her personal life trauma events that have influenced her as an adult.

OPPORTUNITY FOR CITIZENS AND VISITORS TO BE HEARD

Miller Hoffman, C Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania spoke of the upcoming Carlisle Pride week that is being planned for June 13-20, 2020. Hoffman asked for a proclamation be presented to celebrate the lives, families, contributions and recognize Pride Month on June 5, 2020 during a Pride flag raising ceremony. A request was made to Council for permission to create a rainbow painting for chalking on a meaningful crosswalk in downtown.

Mayor Scott noted that Council would be happy to support them.

CONSENT AGENDA

Councilor Fulham-Winston made a motion, seconded by Councilor Landis, to approve the Consent Agenda.

The following items were requested to be removed from the consent agenda:

- C. Attendance Approval: Items 1 and 2*
- E. Public Safety Committee: Item 5(c)*

Council unanimously voted (7-0) to approve the Consent Agenda as amended, which consisted of the following items:

A. **Minutes:**

Council Meeting 02/13/2020

B. Approval of Bills and Investment Transactions:

Expenditures as of February 29, 2020

General Fund	\$ 856,583
Water Fund	\$ 209,708
Sewer Fund	\$ 291,904
Stormwater Fund	\$ 55,618
Solid Waste Fund	\$ 4,521
Capital Projects Fund	\$ 74,605
Parking Fund	\$ 116,430

C. Attendance Approval:

- ~~1. Borough Fire Chief Jeff Snyder to attend Recovery from Disaster: The Local Community Role at National Fire Academy, Emmitsburg, Maryland from March 16 to March 18, 2020.~~
- ~~2. Borough Fire Chief Jeff Snyder to attend the South Central Task Force Homeland Security Conference at Central Penn College in Summerdale, Pennsylvania from March 26 to March 27, 2020.~~
3. Parks Maintenance Supervisor Dave Shatto to attend a Swimming Pool Workshop in Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania from April 8 to April 9, 2020.

D. Economic Development Committee:

1. Borough Council approved a Borough of Carlisle Community Development Block Grant Shopsteading Loan and authorize the Mayor to execute the appropriate loan documents to provide \$35,000 (thirty-five thousand dollars) in CDBG Program Year 2015 funds to Mr. Kirk Ream, Transformation Fitness & Training. Said loan shall reflect a 25-year amortization, two-percent (2%) interest rate, with a balloon payment at seven (7) years. Approval shall be subject to the Borough Solicitor's satisfactory review and approval of said loan documents and provisions outlined by staff.

E. Public Safety Committee:

1. Borough Council approved a request submitted by Carlisle Theatre requesting ten (10) reserved parking spaces on Saturday, March 28, 2020 from 5:00 p.m. until midnight. The reserved parking spaces will be located in front of the Theatre in the first block of W. High Street.
2. Borough Council authorized the closure of the first two blocks of West High Street and the first block of North and South Pitt Streets to Dickinson and Church Avenues from 6:00 a.m. – 8:00 p.m. on Saturday, May 2, 2020 to celebrate the multicultural Amani Festival. Approval subject to the applicant reimbursing the Borough 100% of the variable cost and 10% of the fixed costs incurred by the Borough of Carlisle to conduct this event and receiving Penn DOT approval.
3. Borough Council authorized the temporary closure of Cherry Street between W. High Street and W. Louthier Street on May 16, 2020 from 2:00 – 5:00 p.m. for Dickinson College Baccalaureate. Approval subject to the applicant reimbursing the Borough 100% of the variable cost and 10% of the fixed costs incurred by the Borough of Carlisle to conduct this event and receiving Penn DOT approval.
4. Borough Council authorized the temporary closure of several Borough streets for Dickinson College's 247th Commencement on May 17, 2020 from 8:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m. Approval subject to the applicant reimbursing the Borough 100% of the variable cost and 10% of the fixed costs incurred by the Borough of Carlisle to conduct this event and receiving Penn DOT approval.

5. *Borough Council approved three (3) Special Events Applications submitted by DCA involving street closures as follows:*
 - a. *Ford Parade, June 6, 2020 from 7:00 p.m. – 9:30 p.m.; streets to include: Bryn Mawr Road – I Street. (south to) Carlisle Springs Road/Hanover Street from North Street (south to) South Street/High Street from Bedford (west to) West Street, North and South Pitt from Louthier to Pomfret; East Pomfret to Eagles Lot. No parking between North and Penn Street on Hanover.*
 - b. *Corvette Parade, August 29, 2020 from 6:30 p.m. – 10:00 p.m.; streets to include: Bryn Mawr Road – Clay Street to Hanover Street to South Street. High Street from Bedford (west to) West Street. North and South Pitt Street from Pomfret to Louthier. No parking between North and Penn Street on Hanover.*
 - c. *~~Harvest of the Arts, September 26, 2020 6:00 a.m. – 8:00 p.m.; streets to include: High Street from Hanover Street (West to) College Street. Pitt Street from Louthier (South to) Pomfret/ West Street from Dickinson Alley (South to) Church Avenue.~~*
6. *Borough Council approved a special event request submitted by PPG Paints, 24 West South Street, Carlisle, PA to hold an event on Wednesday, March 25, 2020 from 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. in front of said location. Special event request includes utilizing sidewalk and reserving parking spaces directly in front of the business. Subject to the applicant reimbursing the Borough 100% of the variable cost and 10% of the fixed costs incurred by the Borough of Carlisle to conduct this event.*

OPPORTUNITY FOR CITIZENS AND VISITORS TO BE HEARD

David Lanza stated he reviewed the proposed rental ordinance and had concerns with 193-17 B3. He understands the exemption expands to a 25 miles radius. He explained his understanding that it extends the exemption boundary but then the inspection cycle would be every five-year period, and they are no longer exempt. He stated the cost for landlord will then increase and be passed onto the tenant.

REGULAR AGENDA

TABLED, CONTINUED, AND RECURRING ITEMS

None

REPORTS FROM ELECTED OFFICIALS

A. Mayor’s Report

1. Police Chief Landis and Fire Chief Snyder recognized the Carlisle Regional Special Fire Police for their assistance in successfully locating missing child on January 30, 2020. A unit citation award from the Mayor and Fire Department was presented to the fire police for their actions.
2. Emergency Management Coordinator Chief Snyder:

Chief Snyder provided an update on the COVID-19. He mentioned all the information the Borough had received was from the Center for Disease Control (CDC), World Health Organization and the PA Department of Health. He noted that he met with the Carlisle Barracks, Carlisle Fire Departments, Cumberland-Goodwill EMS. Each entity were asked to address essential functions, facilities, record management, human resources and communications. Chief Snyder will also meet with Borough staff to address these issues as well. He noted records management would be essential in tracking

reimbursable expenditures. Chief Snyder noted that the governor has advised to suspend large gatherings of 250 or more people to mitigate the spread of the coronavirus.

REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES

A. Community Planning & Smart Growth:

1. Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve a waiver for the submission of a Preliminary Land Development Plan for IConstruction LLC, "Former IAC Site – 50 Spring Road", Lots 5, 7, and 8 (226-19) and furthermore; Borough Council approved a waiver of the restriction of only one driveway access per road frontage for Lots 5, 7, and 8 (226-24.K.3.f). (Crampsie/Stuby)
2. Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve a Final Land Development Plan for IConstruction LLC, Lots 5, 7, and 8, dated October 3, 2019 revised February 7, 2020 subject to the applicant's acceptance and satisfactory resolution of the conditions imposed by Borough staff. (Crampsie/Stuby)

Tom Richie, consultant for Carlisle events explained the plans for lots 5, 7 and 8 are on the western side of the Masland site. He noted approval would be brought to the Planning Commission in April for the remaining lots, 4 & 6 then lots 1 & 2. The plans would then be brought Council for approval in April, with construction beginning in May on those lots. It was noted that the community name given to this site is Northside Village.

Greg Holtzman with BL Companies provided an overview of the plans for Lots 5, 7 & 8 on the twenty six acres of land.

- Lot 5 – 4-story apartment building with 120 units and 100 parking spaces
- Lot 7 – 4-story apartment building with 120 units and 100 parking spaces
- Lot 8 – 48- 3 story townhouses units with garages for each unit.
- There was an increase in vehicular circulation by adding an additional access point.

B. ERCPC:

1. Borough Council voted 7-0 to appoint Mr. Edward Hazel to a partial term on the Borough's Sewer System Authority. The candidate's term shall become effective immediately and expire on December 31, 2021. (Stuby/Shultz)
2. Borough Council voted 7-0 to reappoint Mr. Christian Muniz to a third, four-year term on the Planning Commission, which shall become effective immediately and expire on February 29, 2024. (Stuby/Shultz)

C. Public Works Committee:

1. Borough Council, by a roll call vote of 7-0, adopted an ordinance providing for the execution of sewer easement and right-of-entry agreements with the owners of property on which the Borough has sanitary sewer facilities requiring repairs as part of the 2020 Sanitary Sewer System Rehabilitation Project. (Fulham-Winston/Landis)
2. Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve by resolution the submission of a Traffic Signal Permit application to the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation (PennDOT) for the upgrade of the traffic signal at the intersection of Pitt Street and W. High Street. (Fulham-Winston/Landis)

NEW BUSINESS

Katie Hess, Arch Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania, spoke in regard to the LED lighting installation that took place in her neighborhood and how the lighting is intrusive to the properties and houses. She noted that some residents

requested that shields be placed on the lights, but noted the fix was insufficient. Ms. Hess addressed several additional concerns: the lights are a health hazard due to the blue light and high lumen; residents do not know where to submit complaints; the Borough should ensure that every resident receives a full shield installation in Phase II. Ms. Hess asked for an upcoming report be made available for the residents to review the placement of Phase II lights and be able to voice concerns. She offered to help with the implementation of the next phase of lighting.

Mr. Malarich noted the report Ms. Hess was referring to would be provided to Council with placement locations of Phase II bulb replacement.

Borough Manager Armstrong spoke of the undesirable condition of the light pole at Ms. Hess's location and that it was reported to PPL. Ms. Hess noted that PPL did look at the pole and it may be replaced. She asked that all residents receive equity with their lighting situations.

Councilor Landis asked for staff to provide information on the difference between a half shield versus a full shield placement and if they could be placed on all the upgraded lights.

There was discussion exploring a method to streamline the process for requesting a shield on lights and to educate those residents that receive the new lighting to contact the Borough with concerns.

Mr. Michael Smith, 126 South West Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania provided his thoughts and findings on the new LED lights being used by PPL in the Phase II replacement. Mr. Smith's comments are attached to these minutes.

REPORTS FROM COUNCIL MEMBERS & STAFF

Dickinson Law School Student Ambassador Speer noted that Penn State University and Law School would be offering online classes until April 6, 2020, but this date may be reevaluated.

Councilor Stuby noted he attended a New Councilor Boot Camp conducted by the PA State Association of Boroughs. He mentioned his takeaway from the event was that he felt confident about where we are as a Borough and with our staff in comparison to other Boroughs that he spoke with at the event. Councilor Stuby attended the Auditor General's event regarding the climate, which tied in with a previous presentation on greenhouse gases by Dickson College.

Councilor Landis spoke of discussion regarding racial profiling and slurs in conjunction with the recent virus event. She noted Council could address this negative verbiage by using their voices to calm fears and advocate that we are kind and accepting in our town. She also worked with a professor from Dickinson College to perform a test run on penetrating ground radar at Lincoln Cemetery. They found the soil was mostly clay and the radar penetration was not successful.

Councilor Crampsie thanked Fire Chief Snyder for his helpful report. He also expressed his appreciation of staff for their present and future work during this time.

Mayor Scott invited the public to attend the Biennial Goal Planning Session on Saturday, March 14, 2020 at 8:30 a.m.

Deputy Mayor Shultz made note of the recent loss of a local firefighter.

Councilor Fulham-Winston stated that she attended the anniversary event for the Opioid Intervention Court and a lunch that honored the Treatment Court and the Opioid Intervention Court. These two courts are saving people's lives by treating them and diverting them from jail, which enables them to move forward with their lives. She mentioned the Opioid Intervention Court has completed two full years. The program had 58 graduate from the program of the 138 persons enrolled, with only two losses of life. Councilor Fulham-Winston thanked the employees of Water Resources and Public Works for their amazing work on the installation of the stormwater

infrastructure at Valley Meadows as well as the valve replacement that coincided with a UGI project, saving the Borough money is repaving. She also congratulated Stephanie Taylor for the good work that was done to get the new Borough website up and running.

Councilor Hicks noted that he went to the Black Cultural Festival and it was well attended. He mentioned that the County Commissioners have asked him to develop a cost-benefit analysis that would sustain a long-term budget implementation to cover the future Opioid Court costs once the pilot funding is unavailable. Councilor Hicks attended a breakfast with President Ensign to discuss response options. He and Councilor Fulham-Winston attended the Cumberland County Planning Commission meeting where mosquito and Lyme Disease prevention were discussed.

Fire Chief Snyder spoke of the fire fighter from Mount Holly Springs that lost his life in the line of duty.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business or public comment, the meeting adjourned at 8:32 p.m.

Timothy A. Scott
Mayor

Joyce E. Stone
Borough Secretary

Comments provided by Michael Smith

My name is Michael Smith, lifelong Carlisle resident, and I've been following the outdoor lighting transition fairly closely over the past few years. I've been concerned with potential health hazards of new LED lights, so I decided to do some digging and I hope these data can help you come to a conclusion.

First, let's define an important term: color temperature.

A light's color temperature, named after the color emitted by metal glowing when heated to a certain temperature, is a way to denote how "blue" or how "yellow" a white lighting source is. It's measured in "kelvins" with a higher number meaning "cooler" or "bluer" and a lower number meaning "warmer" or "yellower."

Now, let me tell you about high pressure sodium lamps and how our eyes perceive colors of light.

High-pressure sodium lamps, the yellow-orange ones we're used to seeing on the streets of Carlisle, were chosen as the street lighting standard in the 70s for their durability, efficiency, and visibility. They work similarly to fluorescent bulbs and have a color temperature of 2000K, which is quite yellow. However, those touting the "visibility" of sodium bulbs based this off of the assumption that our eyes are better at detecting yellow light. This is true, but only during the daytime; when our eyes adjust for night time vision, yellow light is nearly undetectable and blue light is far more visible. Because of this, a bluer light outputting 1000 lumens (that's a measure of brightness) will appear brighter at night than a yellower light outputting 1000 lumens.

Let's talk about why LED lights are a safer solution for lighting our streets, and a better match for our biology.

LED lamps can produce any color, but the ones which PPL has offered to the borough at no cost have a color temperature of 4000K. The yellower sodium lamps are harder for our eyes to detect at night, so they require more energy and actually have to output more lumens than the bluer LEDs in order to provide the same level of perceived brightness. We can also look to the color rendering index, or CRI: a measurement of a light source's ability to illuminate the full color spectrum, ranging from 0 (a single-colored light) to 100 (the sun). The higher the CRI, the better you'll be able to distinguish between colors. An incandescent bulb has a CRI of around 99, some fluorescents have a CRI of around 70. The new LED bulbs being installed have a CRI of 70, which is far better than the sodium bulbs we currently have, which have a CRI of just 21. This means that distinguishing between colors under an sodium light is incredibly difficult. This can be incredibly dangerous, causing obstacles or even pedestrians to blend in easily with the road. To make matters worse, a study by the Groton, Connecticut utilities research department showed that warmer lights actually decrease drivers' reaction times to pedestrians in the road.

So why the resistance to the new LED lights?

Cooler light is not without its concerns. One neighbor on Nextdoor pointed to a study by the American Medical Association (or AMA) which discussed 3000K LED lights, a slightly yellower fixture, as a preferred alternative to cooler lights, such as the ones which PPL is providing the borough at no cost.

One major concern is glare.

Glare is frequently caused by bluer light sources. The AMA recommended solving this by shielding the light sources. The old sodium bulbs are not fully shielded, so they are actually worse in this regard than the new full-cutoff LED lamps which we have been installing. However, I believe better shielding is a solution worth at least looking into.

What about the environmental impact?

The concern of impact on local species is always an important one to consider, particularly near beaches where sea turtles will get confused after hatching and, believing bluer street lights are the moon, they will wander inland and frequently die. Despite what the fake palm trees in the new apartments down by Walnut Bottom road might have you believe, we do not have sea turtles in Carlisle. I've found no evidence of any local species which are harmed by 4000K light any more than they would be by 3000K light, but I'm interested in hearing from anyone here who has.

Now let's talk light pollution.

Yes, cooler lights do cause more skyglow than warmer lights. The International Dark Sky Association recommends lights be fully-shielded, used only where necessary, illuminate only the intended area, and minimize blue light. Our current fixtures are not dimmable, so they can't be reduced while not in use without being shut off completely, but they do control the spread of light much better than the old sodium lights, as the LED is recessed into the fixture and the beam is more focused on the ground. In terms of blue content, the 3000K light which many have suggested as an alternative would not be much better. According to the US Department of Energy, a 3000K light produces roughly 2.2 times as much blue light as the old sodium lights, while a 4000K light, like the ones we've been installing in Carlisle, produces roughly 2.8 times as much. But there's more: because a 4000K light is easier to detect, it doesn't need to be turned up as bright as would a sodium light or even a 3000K light, which makes this difference even smaller. There is an extremely minimal difference that could be made in making

a switch, though, and we should factor that in. However, if light pollution is our biggest concern, we need to take a serious look at two things: First, the decorative fixtures on High and Hanover streets, which cast light upward. Second, and far, far, more potent, the warehouses, which frequently illuminate themselves with unshielded, sometimes directly skyward bright blue spotlights on spots that don't even need to be lit up, even when the warehouses are closed. Focusing our concerns on the warehouses rather than slightly reducing the color temperature of our streetlights would clarify our night skies exponentially more.

Finally, let's address the human health concerns:

The problem which the AMA brought up was sleep cycle disruption, focusing on the following: You need sleep to be healthy, melatonin makes you sleep, blue light inhibits melatonin production. Fundamentally, this is all true. But it ignores the fact that every wavelength of visible light inhibits melatonin production, blue light is just the most effective at it. So how do we know how much a light will affect our circadian rhythm? Fortunately, we can actually measure this using the International Commission on Illumination's toolbox for determining what's called the "melanopic content" of a light source. The higher the melanopic content, the more a light source impacts your sleep. The melanopic content of a 3000K light, the slightly yellower light which many have suggested as an alternative, is roughly 2.6 times greater than that of the old sodium bulbs. The melanopic content of a 4000K light, the kind being provided at no cost, is roughly 2.9 times higher than that of the old HPS bulbs. As you can see, this difference is minute, and reducing the color temperature by such a small amount would hardly change a thing. Furthermore, the same toolbox can also give us the "scotopic content," or how bright a light appears when our eyes are adjusted for night vision. 4000K lights have a scotopic content 2.4 times that of the old sodium bulbs. Because of this, the borough's most common old sodium lamps which formerly produced 9500 lumens as sodium bulbs now output 4900 lumens as the newly-installed LED bulbs. A reduction in lumens also reduces the melanopic content, so by reducing the lumens to just 51% of what they were before, we end up with the new street lights producing less than 1.5 times the melanopic content of the old sodium lights.

The AMA report actually has gaps in the data, which have now been filled with contradictory information.

The AMA report stated that "MEASUREMENTS AT STREET LEVEL FROM WHITE LED STREET LAMPS ARE NEEDED TO MORE ACCURATELY ASSESS THE POTENTIAL CIRCADIAN IMPACT OF EVENING/NIGHTTIME EXPOSURE TO THESE LIGHTS." Fortunately, researchers at the Lighting Research Center of the Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute did just this, taking measurements of various lights at street level. They determined through various tests that you would need to stand under a 6900K street lamp for one whole hour to experience a small change in melatonin production.

But what about the "ugly" blue light?

As far as aesthetic preference goes, it's hard to argue, because I find warmer lights to be more attractive. I'll note that with the increase in public art that we've been seeing lately thanks to groups like Color Carlisle, a higher CRI like we see in the LEDs is important to be able to view artworks in their full color past sunset. 4000K is also much warmer than what most communities have adopted, with some choosing 5000K or even 6000K lights for their streets.

So why are we using the provided 4000K lights rather than the slightly yellower 3000K lights which many have suggested as an alternative?

The biggest answer is cost: PPL is upgrading the lights for free. There's no way to get any cheaper than this. 4000K lights are also more energy efficient, with some 3000K lights actually being roughly equivalent in efficiency to our old sodium lights. 3000K may be well-suited to areas which don't see much car traffic at night, like cul-de-sacs, but a study by the Virginia Tech Transportation Institute found 4000K to be the temperature most effective at speeding up drivers' reaction times to pedestrians in the roadway. This makes them ideal for a college town where intoxicated pedestrians may coincide with increased weekend evening traffic. 3000K lights are certainly more attractive, which is also an important consideration to make. Other than these, the differences between the two are marginal at best.

I'll conclude with the following:

The primary goal of street lights is safety. Our old high-pressure sodium lamps are bad at accomplishing this goal. The AMA report that has been circulating is both flawed and frequently misinterpreted, with many people believing that blue light and only blue light is bad for your health. The impact which a 4000K LED light will have on your safety and your energy consumption is positive, the impact it will have on your health is negligible at best, and the impact it will have on your wallet is absolutely zero. To switch to a 3000K bulb would have a minor negative impact on road safety in comparison, would make almost no change whatsoever to the health impacts, and would come at great financial expense. I get that we don't like the new lights very much, and there are some genuinely good reasons to support a switch to 3000K lights. However, health concerns as many of us fear are a nonissue when it comes to this switch. Let's be honest about why we oppose these lights, and let's let science and data about human health and safety drive our decisions.